

Principal Hiring Scorecard

Appendix D of the Guidebook to Competency-Based Principal Hiring

OCTOBER 2018



Principal Hiring Scorecard

Appendix D of the Guidebook to Competency-Based Principal Hiring

October 2018



1 South Riverside
Chicago, IL
800.356.2735 | 630.649.6500
www.air.org

Appendix D. Principal Hiring Scorecard

The Principal Hiring Scorecard will help you assess where your LEA is currently and can help you pinpoint which sections of the *Guidebook* will be most useful to you.

A high-quality principal hiring process has far-ranging impacts on the leadership and student learning in a given school. From our perspective, the principal hiring should be fair, rigorous, and data-driven, and its results should inform new principal induction and mentoring processes. The first step in developing a strong principal hiring process is to identify strengths and areas of growth for your current principal hiring process. What elements of the process do you currently do well, and what aspects can you improve upon?

Please circle the response for each question that best describes the principal hiring process in your district. After you complete the scorecard you will go back and score it.

1. Outside Recruitment

- a. There is no central source for handling the recruitment process. Recruitment is typically done through word of mouth and few electronic or print advertisements to publicize offerings. We primarily publicize openings in one or two venues.
- b. We have a principal recruitment plan that is coordinated by a single office or officer. The district uses word of mouth and electronic or print advertising to publicize openings, as well as also through school/district and state education agency websites and state postings at universities/colleges. We use a mix of methods (more than two or three), and we publicize throughout our surrounding region.
- c. We have a principal recruitment plan that is coordinated by a single office or officer, and we conduct a targeted search based on school/district leadership needs. The district uses a mix of methods to publicize openings, including word of mouth, print advertising, websites, email, social media, and job fairs. We publicize throughout our surrounding region, and, occasionally, at the national level.

2. Internal Recruitment

- a. We encourage candidates within the district or school to apply for open positions. All candidates, of course, must meet basic qualifications. We do not have a structured process in place to build teacher-leader or assistant principal skills and knowledge to prepare them to become principals. We provide incentives to assistant principals and teachers to encourage them to obtain their administrative licenses.
- b. We encourage candidates within the district or school to apply for open positions, and all candidates must meet basic qualifications. We have trained current principals to mentor assistant principals and teachers to build their skills as leaders, but we do not have performance evaluation processes in place to determine whether or not new leaders are capable and effective. Special leadership positions or additional responsibilities are not available to new leaders. We provide incentives to assistant principals and teachers to encourage them to get their administrative licenses.

- c. We encourage candidates within the district or school to apply for open positions, and all candidates must meet basic qualifications. We provide incentives to assistant principals and teachers to encourage them to get their administrative licenses. We also have a “grow your own” leadership program that includes mentoring from principals or other leaders, evaluation of new leaders’ skills and competencies, and formalized opportunities to lead school-wide efforts.

3. Recruitment Effectiveness

- a. As a result of our recruitment efforts, we receive less than ten applications per opening. Typically, one or two of these applications are viable or high quality.
- b. As a result of our recruitment efforts, we receive 10 to 15 applications per opening. Typically, three to five of these applications are viable or high quality.
- c. As a result of our recruitment efforts, we receive 10 to 15 applications per opening. Typically, five or more of these applications are viable or high quality.

4. Pace of Initial Candidate Review

- a. Once applications are received, they are reviewed in one or more weeks.
- b. Once applications are received, they are reviewed within a week or so.
- c. Once applications are received, they are reviewed within a day or two.

5. Quality of Initial Candidate Review

- a. The initial review is typically conducted by one person. Criteria for the review may or may not be specified. Documentation of the review may or may not occur.
- b. The initial review is typically conducted by two or more people, who independently review candidate credentials. Criteria used for the review are not specified. Documentation of the review may or may not occur.
- c. The initial review is typically conducted by two or more people, who independently review candidate credentials. Reviewers use the same criteria when reviewing candidate credentials. Documentation of the review process occurs and records are kept.

6. Breadth of Information Used for Review

Below is a list of documents or processes used to evaluate principal candidates:

- Resume
 - Cover letter
 - Letter(s) of recommendation
 - Transcripts
 - Certification
 - References
 - Writing sample
 - Telephone interview by district/school personnel
 - In-person interview by district staff
 - In-person interview by school staff and/or community members
- a. My district relies primarily on items 1 to 5 of the above measures to assess principal candidates.

- b. My district primarily relies on items 1 to 8 of the above measures to assess principal candidates.
- c. My district primarily relies on items 1 to 10 to assess principal candidates.

7. Selection of Candidate Reviewers

- a. Candidate reviewers do not receive any training. They are intelligent people, after all, and know how to hire people and know what a good school leader must do.
- b. Candidate reviewers receive some training about the hiring process, and the legalities of that process. However, training does not include discussion of criteria for assessing candidates or hiring priorities.
- c. Candidate reviewers receive some training about the hiring process, and the legalities of the process. Training also includes discussion of criteria for assessing candidates and hiring priorities. We establish some reliability among the candidate reviewers to ensure that they are on the same page.

8. Fairness of the Review

- a. All candidates have to submit the same basic information about their credentials to be considered for the position. However, we are not very consistent with our use of interview questions or additional methods of evaluating candidates. We do not consistently maintain applicant records.
- b. All candidates have to submit the same basic information about their credentials to be considered for the position. Interviewers generally ask the same questions of all candidates, and generally use the same additional methods for evaluating candidates. We consistently maintain applicant records.
- c. All candidates have to submit the same basic information about their credentials to be considered for the position. Interviewers ask the same questions of all candidates, and use the same additional methods for evaluating candidates. Interview questions and tasks or simulations are determined ahead of time. Our process is structured so that all candidates have the same opportunities to display their skills and abilities. We consistently maintain applicant records.

9. Candidates Match to School

- a. We hire the same type of candidate regardless of school leadership needs or community characteristics.
- b. We sometimes make efforts to take school leadership needs or community characteristics into account. However, our process does not involve much input from school members or review of school-based or community-based information. When we set priorities for a hire, we may or may not follow these priorities.
- c. We consistently make an effort to take school leadership needs or community characteristics into account. Our process intentionally involves priority setting that takes the school and community situation into account. We often review school- or community-based information when setting priorities. When we set priorities for a hire, we generally follow these priorities.

10. Extent to Which Data Inform the Process

- a. The hiring committee does not require candidates to demonstrate their skills in using data to inform the hiring process.
- b. The hiring committee partially requires candidates to demonstrate their skills in using data. Candidates are asked about the emphasis they place on using data and their skill at using it, but there are no assessments as part of the hiring process.
- c. The hiring committee has a clear emphasis on candidates' skills of using data to inform the hiring process. A number of questions in the interview emphasize the candidate's skills using data. Also, candidates are presented with scenarios using data that they need to complete and on which they are rated.

11. Criteria for Hiring Process

- a. We do not have explicit criteria for hiring a new principal. Decision-makers apply their own criteria, and deliberate which criteria are most important.
- b. We have some "home grown" criteria for hiring a new principal that are generally accepted by a core group of staff.
- c. We have criteria for hiring a new principal that are tied to national/state standards and based on research on what good principals must know and do. These criteria are written down and applied. The criteria are generally accepted by a core group of staff.

12. Effectiveness of the Hiring Process

- a. We do not measure the effectiveness of the hiring process in any meaningful way. We generally do not collect information from candidates about the ease of the hiring process. We do not collect information from schools or others about how well the new principal meets school needs. We do not consider principal performance or retention information when revising our recruitment and hiring process.
- b. We consider information from schools or others on how well the new principal meets school needs and performs. We consider principal performance and retention information when revising our recruitment and hiring process. We do not collect information from schools or others about how well the new principal meets school needs.
- c. We consider information from schools or others on how well the new principal meets school needs and performs. We consider principal performance and retention information when revising our recruitment and hiring process. We generally do collect information from candidates about the ease of the hiring process.

13. Alignment to Human Capital Management Systems

- a. Information gathered during the hiring process is not used to plan induction or mentoring services to new principals. We generally do not offer induction programs, mentoring support, and/or reduced workloads to new principal or principals who are new to the school or district.
- b. Information gathered during the hiring process is not used to plan induction or mentoring services to new principals. We do offer induction programming, mentoring support, and/or reduced workloads to new principals or principals who are new to the school or district.

- c. Information gathered during the hiring process is considered when planning induction or mentoring services to new principals. We do offer induction programming, mentoring support, and/or reduced workloads to new principals or principals who are new to the school or district.

Scoring Instructions

Part A

Now that you have finished the quiz please calculate your overall score on the quiz by tallying the number of points for each question. The scoring system is as follows: “a” = 1 point, “b” = 2, and “c” = 3. The levels of scoring below indicate the quality of your principal hiring process. This quiz has not been validated but is a quick and easy way to gauge your district’s process.

- 30 to 39 points = Wow, you’re doing a terrific job. You should share your practices with others.
- 26 to 30 points = Pretty good! There may be some things that you want to focus on in order to improve the recruitment and/or hiring processes, or the consistency with which recruitment and hiring occurs.
- 13 to 26 points = Not bad, but could be better. You may want to consider changing your hiring and recruitment processes and adding components/steps to the process.

Part B

Now that you have reflected on your overall process, you can use the following guide to determine how to use the Guidebook to Competency-Based Principal Hiring.

- If you chose “a or b” on questions 1-6, please consider reviewing Step 2, Recruiting Candidates, Conducting the Application Screening, and Determining Semifinalist section of the Guidebook.
- If you chose “a or b” on questions 7-8, please consider reviewing Step 1, Forming the Hiring Committee and Setting Priorities section of the Guidebook.
- If you chose “a or b” on questions 9 and 11, please consider reviewing Task 1.4 of the Guidebook.
- If you chose “a or b” on question 10, please consider reviewing Step 4, Conducting the On-Site Screening and Ranking the Finalists section of the Guidebook.
- If you chose “c” for every question, again, congratulations! However, you could still pick up a strategy or two from the guidebook by choosing the topic that is most relevant or interesting for your LEA/school and enjoy!

ABOUT AMERICAN INSTITUTES FOR RESEARCH

Established in 1946, with headquarters in Washington, D.C., the American Institutes for Research (AIR) is an independent, nonpartisan, not-for-profit organization that conducts behavioral and social science research and delivers technical assistance both domestically and internationally. As one of the largest behavioral and social science research organizations in the world, AIR is committed to empowering communities and institutions with innovative solutions to the most critical challenges in education, health, workforce, and international development.



AMERICAN INSTITUTES FOR RESEARCH®

1120 East Diehl Road, Suite 200
Naperville, IL 60563-1486
800.356.2735 | 630.649.6500

www.air.org

Making Research Relevant

Copyright © 2018, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010 American Institutes for Research. All rights reserved.

This work was originally produced in whole or in part with funds from the U.S. Department of Education's Fund for the Improvement of Education (FIE) Earmark Grant Awards Program under grant number U215K080187. The content does not necessarily reflect the position or policy of the Education Department, nor does mention or visual representation of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement.

4881_07/18